
LATIN AMERICAN THOUGHT: PHILOSOPHICAL PROBLEMS AND ARGUMENTS

Susana Nuccetelli



A Member of the Perseus Books Group

CONTENTS

Preface

xiii

1 The Epistemic Practices of Latin American Indians: A Puzzle for Philosophers

I

Why Should We Care About Native Cultures? 2

Rational Prediction in the West, 3

Prediction Among the Mayans, 4

The Case of Mayan Astrology, 5

The Case of Mayan Prophecies, 8

What Sort of Rationality Is Mayan Rationality? 9

An Argument for Strong Rationalism, 10

The Principle of Charity Versus

Strong Rationalism, 12

A Further Objection to Strong Rationalism, 13

The Bridgehead View, 14

First Objection to the Bridgehead View, 16

Second Objection to the Bridgehead View, 17

Weak Rationality and Critical Thinking, 19

Discussion Questions, 20

Suggestions for Further Reading, 22

Notes, 22

2 Could the Mayans Think? And What About Us?

25

The Weak Rationality Argument, 27

Human Rationality and Animal Rationality, 27

A Metaphorical Interpretation of Mayan Prediction, 29	
"True for the Mayans," 30	
Is Rationality Relative? 32	
"True in the Context of Mayan Culture," 33	
Ordinary Thinkers Versus Super Thinkers, 35	
Cognitive Pluralism, 38	
Super Thinkers Versus Animal Thinkers, 38	
Neither Super Thinkers nor Animal Thinkers, 40	
Mayan Rationality Reconsidered, 42	
Could the Natives of Latin America Think? 43	
Why the Mayans' Massive Error Does Not Amount to Irrationality, 45	
Discussion Questions, 46	
Suggestions for Further Reading, 48	
Notes, 48	

3	Native Folk Cosmologies Versus Western Philosophy and Science	49
	Understanding the Natural World:	
	Latin America and the West, 50	
	Folk Cosmologies in Latin America, 51	
	Folk Cosmologies in the West, 53	
	Questions That Make Little Sense to Ask, 53	
	Are Folk Cosmologies Philosophy? 55	
	Did Ancient Latin American Civilizations Have Any Philosophy? 56	
	What Bernardino de Sahagún Saw in the Colonies, 57	
	Is Philosophy Universal? Latin Americans Follow the West, 58	
	Antonio Caso on the Philosophical Character, 59	
	José Vasconcelos' "Super-Criterion," 61	
	Argumentation as a Demarcation Criterion, 62	
	The Ancestors of Philosophy in the West, 62	
	The Ancestors of Philosophy in Latin America, 63	
	Philosophy Today in Latin America and the West, 64	
	Discussion Questions, 66	

Suggestions for Further Reading, 67

Notes, 67

- 4 **The Legacy of 1492: Pluralism, Relativism, and the
Clash of Cultures** 69
 - What Would Santayana Say About Magic
Thought and Prayers? 71
 - Could Magic Really Help in Understanding the
Natural World? 73
 - Relativism Revisited: The Linguistic Argument, 74
 - A Contribution from Cultural Anthropology, 76
 - Avoiding Ethnocentrism, 77
 - Getting Tough-Minded, 78
 - Pluralism Without Cultural Relativism, 79
 - Completing the Analogy, 81
 - Philosophy, Science, and World Cultures, 82
 - Francisco Romero: Not All Cultures Are
Created Equal, 82
 - The "Species Chauvinism" Objection
Against Romero, 83
 - Is There a Natural Selection of Cultures? 85
 - Discussion Questions, 88
 - Suggestions for Further Reading, 90
 - Notes, 91

- 5 **Thomistic Philosophy and the Conquest:
Human Rights in the New World** 93
 - Human Rights: A Moral Dilemma, 94
 - Conflict of Cultures and of Religions, Too, 98
 - Was the Conquest Morally Justified? 101
 - Were the Indians "Natural Slaves"? 102
 - The Theory of Natural Slaves in Context, 107
 - Sepúlveda Defeated by a Non-Scholastic
Alternative, 108
 - Montaigne and the Relativist Alternative, 110
 - Las Casas's Scholastic Defense of the
Rights of the Indians, 114

	Lascasianism: A Philosophy or a Political Agenda?	119
	Vitoria: Humanism About International Law and Natural Rights,	123
	Discussion Questions,	128
	Suggestions for Further Reading,	131
	Notes,	133
6	Iberian Scholasticism and Its Critics: From Colonial Rule to Independence	137
	The Scholastic Paradigm,	138
	José de Acosta Versus Aristotelian Science,	143
	Acosta's Concerns in Perspective,	147
	Sor Juana: Could Women Think in Colonial Mexico?	149
	The Perils of a Certain Scholastic Dispute,	152
	Was Sor Juana a Radical Feminist?	155
	Colonial Scholasticism in Context,	159
	Simón Bolívar: Independence Leads to Puzzles,	160
	Must Political Systems Accommodate Ethnic Diversity?	165
	Sarmiento's Dilemma: Whose Civilization Is Preferable to Barbarism?	166
	Is There a Connection Between Race and Character? <i>Facundo's</i> Ethnic Stereotypes,	168
	Discussion Questions,	173
	Suggestions for Further Reading,	175
	Notes,	176
7	Latin Americans, North Americans, and the Rest of the World	179
	Autochthonous Positivists,	180
	Positivism in Brazil,	183
	Latin American Positivists and "First Philosophy,"	187
	Positivism in Mexico,	189

Rodó on Hispanic Identity:	
A True Latin Americanist? 193	
<i>Ariel</i> Vindicated: The Latin American	
Critique of the United States, 197	
Martí on Social Justice and the Americas, 201	
Indians, Land, and Race, 204	
The Actual Needs of the Oppressed, 208	
The Oppressed Against Mariátegui, 211	
Discussion Questions, 212	
Suggestions for Further Reading, 214	
Notes, 216	

8	Latin American Identity: Ethnicity, Name, and Thought	223
	The Collective Identity of Latin Americans:	
	A Puzzle, 224	
	Describing Versus Evaluating Ethnic Groups, 227	
	A Latin American Race? 228	
	Collective Identity: A Resolution, 231	
	Should Latin Americans Have No Name at All? 232	
	Is There a Reason to Name Groups of People? 235	
	"Hispanics" Versus "Latinos," 236	
	A Characteristically Latin American Philosophy?	
	Getting Critical, 240	
	Philosophy <i>in</i> Latin America Versus	
	Latin American Philosophy, 243	
	How Is Latin American Philosophy Possible? 246	
	Latin American Thought Versus	
	Latin America Philosophy, 248	
	Discussion Questions, 253	
	Suggestions for Further Reading, 255	
	Notes, 256	

<i>Author Index</i>	261
<i>Subject Index</i>	265