

METAPHYSICS IN PROCESS

A SELECTED HISTORY OF ANCIENT PHILOSOPHY
AS AN INTRODUCTION TO THE PHILOSOPHY OF BEING

Joseph L. Papay, Ph.D.
Saint Peter's College

The Florham Park Press, Inc.
Box 225, Madison, New Jersey

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PART ONE: THE PRE-SOCRATIC PERIOD IN ANCIENT GREEK PHILOSOPHY

CHAPTER I. THALES TO HERACLITUS: THE ONE AND THE MANY.....	1
1. THE ORIGINS OF PHILOSOPHY: THALES OF MILETUS.....	1
A. Thales' Teaching, 3	
B. The Meaning of Thales' Doctrine, 4	
C. The Reasons for Thales' Doctrine, 4	
D. The Value of Thales' Doctrine, 5	
(1) <i>Thales' Philosophy versus Mythology</i> , 6	
(2) <i>Thales' Philosophy versus Science</i> , 6	
(3) <i>The Problem(s) of Change</i> , 6	
(4) <i>The Problem(s) of the One and the Many</i> , 7	
2. ANAXIMANDER OF MILETUS: THE INDEFINITE.....	8
A. Anaximander's Teaching, 8	
B. The Meaning or Interpretation of Anaximander's Doctrine, 9	
C. & D. Reasons for, and Evaluation of, Anaximander's Teaching, 10	
3. ANAXIMENES OF MILETUS: AIR.....	13
A. Anaximenes' Teaching, 13	
B., C., D. Interpretation, Reasons, Evaluation of His Position, 13	
MONISM, AND VARIOUS POSITIONS ON THE (NON-SUCCESSIVE) ONE AND MANY.....	15
DYNAMISM OR DYNAMICISM, AND VARIOUS POSITIONS ON CHANGE OR ON THE SUCCESSIVE ONE AND MANY.....	17
4. PYTHAGORAS OF SAMOS: NUMBERS, FINITE AND INFINITE.....	18
A. Pythagoreanism, 18	
B. & C. Meaning and Arguments for Pythagoreanism, 19	
D. Evaluation of Pythagoreanism, 22	
E. The Older Pythagoreans, 24	
5. XENOPHANES OF COLOPHON: ONE GOD THE GREATEST.....	26
6. HERACLITUS OF EPHEBUS: FIRE, CHANGE, AND LOGOS	26
A. Heracliteanism, 27	
B. & C. Interpretations and Reasons for Heracliteanism, 28	

D. Evaluation of Heracliteanism, 31

- (1) *Heraclitus in Relation to His Predecessors, 31*
 - (a) *Heraclitus and Milesian Monism; (b) Heraclitean Unity Not Only in Cosmic Change but Chiefly in the Law of Change; (c) Heraclitus and the Apeiron and Limit; (d) Heraclitean Opposites Combined Not Only Dynamically but Simultaneously and in the same Subject and Place.*
- (2) *Heraclitus' Most Original Ideas, 33*
 - (a) *The Heraclitean Logos; (b) Heraclitean Epistemology; (c) Heraclitean Psychology; (d) Heraclitean Social Psychology.*
- (3) *Heraclitus in Relation to Future Philosophy, 35*
 - (a) *Heraclitus and Parmenidean Eleaticism; (b) Heraclitus and Plato; (c) Heraclitus and the Stoics; (d) Heraclitus and Hegel and Dialecticism; (e) Heraclitus and Bergson.*

CHAPTER II. PARMENIDES AND THE ELEATICS:

THE ONE, NO MANY 37

7. PARMENIDES OF ELEA: BEING, ONE AND IMMUTABLE..... 37

A. Parmenideanism, 37

B. Interpretation of Parmenideanism, 38

C. Arguments for Parmenideanism, 40

- (1) *Exposition of the Parmenidean Absolute Opposition Between Being and Non-Being, 40*
- (2) *Arguments In Behalf of Parmenidean Absolute Monism, 40*
 - (a) *A First Monistic Argument: From the Impossibility of "Being Different"; (b) A Second Monistic Argument: From the Impossibility of "Difference Itself"; (c) A Third Monistic Argument: From the Impossibility of "Infinite Division."*
- (3) *Arguments in Behalf of Parmenidean Absolute Staticism, 45*
 - (a) *A First Staticist Argument: From the Impossibility of "Becoming Different"; (b) A Second Staticist Argument: From the Impossibility of "Difference Itself"; (c) A Third Staticist Argument: From the Impossibility of "Empty Space."*

D. Evaluation of Parmenidean Eleaticism, 46

- (1) *Parmenides and His Pluralistic Predecessors, Basic and Derivative, 46*
- (2) *The Problems of Interpreting Parmenides, 47*

- (a) *Is Limit a Contradiction in Parmenideanism?* (b) *Is Parmenidean Being Material (Spatial) or Spiritual?*
- (c) *Is the Way of Opinion Complete Error or Sensible Truth?*

- (3) *Parmenidean Epistemology*, 52
- (4) *Parmenides' Achilles' Heel*, 53
- (5) *Parmenides' Enduring Challenge*, 54
- (6) *Parmenides' Positive Contributions to Future Philosophy*, 54
 - (a) *Parmenides and Being*; (b) *Parmenides and Unity, Static and Dynamic*; (c) *Parmenides and Eternity*; (d) *Parmenides and Perfection or Value*; (e) *Parmenides and Pantheism and Monotheism*.

8. ZENO OF ELEA: AGAINST THE MANY	57
A. <i>Zeno's Arguments Against Plurality</i> , 57	
B. <i>Zeno's Arguments Against Motion</i> , 59	
C. <i>Zeno's Arguments Against Sensation</i> , 60	
D. <i>Zeno and the Notion of a Continuum</i> , 61	
9. MELISSUS OF SAMOS: THE INFINITY OF BEING	62

CHAPTER III. THE PLURALISTIC COMPROMISERS.... 67

10. EMPEDOCLES OF ACRAGAS: THE ULTIMATE FOUR OR MORE ..	67
11. PHILOLAUS OF TARENTUM: NUMBER MYSTICISM	70
12. ARCHYTAS OF TARENTUM: NUMBER RATIONALISM	71
13. ANAXAGORAS OF CLAZOMENAE: EVERYTHING IN EVERYTHING	72
14. DIOGENES OF APOLLONIA: GOD IS AIR	76
15. CRATYLUS OF ATHENS: YOU CANNOT STEP INTO THE SAME RIVER ONCE	77
16. ANTISTHENES OF EPHEBUS	77
17-18. ANCIENT PHILOSOPHICAL ATOMISM	77
17. LEUCIPPUS THE ATOMIST: ATOMS AND THE VOID	77
18. DEMOCRITUS OF ABDERA: NAUGHT EXISTS LIKE AUGHT	78
A. <i>Democritus' Writings</i> , 78	
B. & C. <i>Meaning and Reasons for Atomism</i> , 78 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (1) <i>Atomistic Metaphysics</i>, 78 (2) <i>Atomistic Cosmology or Physics</i>, 79 (3) <i>Atomistic Cosmogogenesis and Teleology</i>, 81 (4) <i>Atomistic Epistemology and Psychology or Anthropology</i>, 81 (5) <i>Atomistic Theology</i>, 82 (6) <i>Atomistic Ethics</i>, 83 	
D. <i>Evaluation of Atomism as Philosophy</i> , 83	
19. NESSAS OF CHIOS, METRODORUS OF CHIOS, DIOGENES OF SMYRNA	85

20. ANAXARCHUS OF ABDERA: KNOWING IS DREAMING.....	85
21. NAUSIPHANES OF TEOS: ALL EXPERIENCE IS REAL.....	86
 CHAPTER IV. THE SOPHISTS:	
HUMANISM AND CULTURAL PLURALISM	87
22. THE SOPHIST PROTAGORAS OF ABDERA: MAN IS THE MEASURE OF ALL THINGS.....	92
A. Protagoreanism, 92	
B. The Interpretation of Protagoreanism, 92	
C. & D. Reasons and Evaluation of Protagoreanism, 94	
23. XENIADES OF CORINTH: BEING BECOMES NON-BEING.....	95
24. THE SOPHIST GORGIAS OF LEONTINI: NOTHING EXISTS.....	95
A. The Sophism of Gorgias, 95	
B. The Nihilism of Gorgias, 96	
C. Arguments for Gorgian Nihilism, 96	
(1) <i>Arguments for Ontological Nihilism, 96</i>	
(2) <i>Arguments for Epistemological Nihilism, Skepticism, Agnosticism, 97</i>	
(3) <i>Arguments for Communicational or Linguistic Nihilism, 98</i>	
D. Evaluation of Gorgias' Sophistic Nihilism, 98	
25. LYCOPHRON THE SOPHIST: KNOWING IS UNION.....	100
26. OTHER SOPHISTS OF THE FIFTH CENTURY B.C.: ART AND NATURE.....	100

PART TWO: THE SOCRATIC PERIOD
IN ANCIENT GREEK PHILOSOPHY

CHAPTER V. SOCRATES AND THE LESSER SOCRATICS:	
TOWARD ETHICAL ABSOLUTISM THROUGH SUBJECTIVE RELATIVISM.....	107
27. SOCRATES OF ATHENS: I KNOW THAT I DO NOT KNOW.....	108
A. Sources or Quotations for Socratic Philosophy, 108	
B. & C. Socratism: Doctrine and Method, 109	
D. Socrates' Influence on Future Philosophy, 111	
E. Socrates, the Man Who Was More Than His Philosophy, 113	
28-31. THE LESSER OR MINOR SOCRATICS: VIRTUE IS KNOWLEDGE.....	114
28. EUCLIDES AND THE MEGARIANS: EVIL IS NON-BEING.....	114
29. PHAEDO AND MENEDEMUS AND THE ELEAN-ERETRIANS.....	115
30. ANTISTHENES AND THE CYNICS: VIRTUE IS DOING.....	115
31. ARISTIPPUS AND THE CYRENAICS: VIRTUE IS GETTING.....	117
 CHAPTER VI. PLATONIC METAPHYSICS:	
UNITY AS GENERALITY	118

- A. The Platonic Dialogues, 119
- B. Introduction to Plato's "Theory of Ideas," 121
- C. Background and Genesis of the Platonic Metaphysics of Ideas, 127
- (1) *The Socratic Contribution*, 127
 - (2) *The Parmenidean Contribution*, 128
 - (3) *The Heraclitean Contribution*, 130
- D. Plato's Metaphysics of Forms as a Positive Synthesis of the One and the Many, 131
- (1) *Plato's Two-World Reality – or Better, Two-Realm World*, 131
 - (2) *Definitions and Subdivisions of "Universal,"* 136
 - (a) "Universal" in its Ordinary, Non-Technical Sense, 136
 - (b) "Universal" in its Special, Technical Sense, 136
 - (1) *Word or Term*, 136; (2) *Thought or Concept*, 137;
 - (3) *Class*, 138; (4) *Nature, Essence, or Form*, 139.
 - (3) *Plato's Four Quadrant Reality or Doubly "Divided" World*, 146
 - (4) *Various Positions, Theories, Interpretations of Universals*, 154
 - (a) *Realism or Objectivism of Universals*, 154
 - (1) *Naive, Exaggerated, CONCRETE or Ultra-realism*, 155; (2) *ABSTRACT EXEMPLARISTIC Realism*, 161; ((a) *Purely TRANSCENDENT or Separatistic*, 162; and (b) *PARTICIPATORY*, 163); and (3) *ABSTRACT Purely IMMANENT or MODERATE Realism*, 165
 - (b) *Non-Realism or Subjectivism of Universals*, 165
 - (1) *Conceptualism*, 165; and (2) *Nominalism*, 166.
 - (5) *Brief Historical Review of the Problem of Universals*. 166
 - (5) *Four Important Universal Realists*, 172
 - (a) *Plato*, 163; (b) *Aristotle*, 173; (c) *St. Augustine and Christian Platonism*, 174; (d) *St. Thomas Aquinas and Christian Aristotelianism*, 176.
 - (6) *Arguments Supporting the (a) Objectivity, (b) Independence, and (c) Eternity of Universal Essences*, 179

Could there have been a time when absolutely nothing – no being – existed at all? 183.
 - (7) *Plato and the Transcendentals*, 185
 - (8) *Toward a More Complete Platonic Picture of Reality*, 186
 - (9) *Participation as the Instance-Exemplar Relationship*, 188
 - (a) *Participation and Non-Identity or Difference*, 189;
 - (b) *Participation and Possession or "Having,"* 190;
 - (c) *Participation and Identity or Sameness*; 191, (d) *Participation and Likeness, Similarity, Imitation, Resemblance*, 191; (e) *Participation and Sharing*, 192;

- (f) *Preliminary Descriptions of Participation*, 192; (g) *Analogies or Some Unusual Instances of Participation*, 193; (h) *The Cumulative Technical Definition of Participation*, 194.
- (10) *Platonism as a Reformed Parmenideanism*, 197
- (11) *Reprise of Plato on the One and the Many*, 198
- (12) *Platonism as a Revitalized and Rationalized Heracliteanism*, 201
- Summary Review Chart of Platonic and Pre-Platonic Ontologies*, 202

CHAPTER VII. THE PLATONIC TRADITION: A SECOND LOOK: UNITY AS PERSONALITY 206

E. Complicating Elements in Platonic Metaphysics, 206

- (1) *Reprise of Plato on Change and Motion – and the Soul or the Position of Man*, 206
- (2) *The World Soul, the “Idea of the Good,” and Platonic Theology*, 208
- (3) *Platonism and Pythagoreanism*, 213
 - (a) *The Finite and the Infinite*, 214; (b) *Soul and Body*, 215; (c) *Mathematics, the “Mathematicals,” and Reality*, 216.
- (4) *Does Plato Advocate One World or a Divisive Dualism?* 218
- (5) *What is the Relation Between “Participation,” “Communion” or “Mixing,” and “Imitation”?* 221
- (6) *Platonic Refutations of (not the Position but) the Arguments for Parmenideanism*, 223
 - (a) *Platonic Refutations of Arguments for Absolute Monism*, 223; and (b) *Platonic Refutations of Arguments for Absolute Staticism*, 228.
- (7) *The Relation Between “Difference” and “Limitation” in Plato*, 229
- (8) *A Summary of Platonic Meanings of “Being” and “Non-Being,”* 231
- (9) *Plotinian Neo-Platonism as an Interpretation of Plato*, 233
- (10) *The Platonic Exemplaristic Contribution to the Christian View of God*, 235

F. Platonic Philosophy and Science and Art, 238

G. Plato’s Ethics and Politics (or Social Humanism), 244

H. Conclusion on Plato, 246

33. THE ACADEMY AND THE PLATONISTS247

A. The Platonic “Institutional Tradition” of the Academicians, 247

- (1) *The Old or First Academy*, 247
- (2) *The Middle or Second Academy*, 247
- (3) *The New Academy, Third and/or Fourth*, 247

B. The Platonic "Doctrinal Tradition" of the Platonists, 248

(1) *Middle Platonism, 248*

(2) *Neo-Platonism, 248*

C. The Platonic Tradition to the Present, 250

CHAPTER VIII. ARISTOTLE AND THE PERIPATETIC TRADITION: UNITY AS ORDER 251

34. ARISTOTLE OF STAGIRA: COSMIC COMPILER..... 251

A. The Aristotelian Corpus, 252

B. A Primer of Principal Aristotelian Metaphysical Concepts, 254

(1) *Change, 254*

(a) *Analysis of Change, 254; (b) Classifications of Change, 255;*

((1) Creation, 256; (2) Annihilation, 257; (3) Change in the Strict, Narrow, and "Proper" Sense, 258;

(a) Substantial, and (b) Accidental);

(c) *Causes as Prerequisites and Explanations of Change, 259 ((1) Analysis and*

((1) Analysis and Definition of Cause, 259; (2)

Classifications of Causes or Real Principles, 259

(a) Intrinsic Causes or Intrinsic Ontological

Principles, 259 ((ONE) Material, 260, and (TWO)

Formal, 260) and (b) Extrinsic Causes or Extrinsic

Ontological Principles, 261 ((THREE) Efficient, 261,

(FOUR) Final, 262, and (FIVE) Exemplary, 263); and

(d) *Other Aristotelian Analyses and Principles of Change and being*

((1) Act and Potency, 263; (2) Substance and Accident, 265; and (3) Hylomorphism or Matter and Form, 266)

(2) *Problems and Difficulties in Interpreting Aristotle, 270*

(3) *Aristotle on the One and the Many, 272*

(4) *Aristotelian Rational Theology, 276*

(5) *Aristotelian Psychology and Philosophy of Man, 277*

35. THE PERIPATETIC TRADITION 278

A. Early Aristotelians, 278

B. Later Aristotelians, 279

C. Aristotle to the Present, 279

APPENDIX A: ARISTOTELIAN METAPHYSICAL LEXICON 281

APPENDIX B: CHART OF DIAGRAMS OF PRINCIPAL ARISTOTELIAN CONCEPTS, PRINCIPLES, AND PROBLEMS..... 282

NOTES TO TEXT..... 285

SELECTED AND CRITICAL BIBLIOGRAPHY 315

INDEX..... 335